

(SRI K. F. PATIL)

effective results. However, arrangements have been made for retail sale of rice and wheat through Fair Price shops throughout the State, with a view to stabilise the prices.

### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE.

Sri K. F. PATIL (Minister for Forests and Transport).—I beg to lay on the Table a statement furnishing the information in connection with Starred Question No. 1 regarding the names and charges against 34 Drivers of the M.G.R.T.D. given notice of by Sri E. Narayana Gowda.

### CONDOLENCE REFERENCE

**Re: Demise of Sri Pattabhi Sitaramayya.**

Mr. SPEAKER.—It is with deep regret that I rise to refer to the death of Dr. B. Pattabhi Sitaramayya. He had been associated with the struggle for freedom for over 60 years first as a volunteer, later as a delegate and finally as the President of the All India Congress. He had devoted his whole life to the cause of Indian freedom. Even after Independence, he continued to serve the country as Governor of Madhya Pradesh. The official history of the Congress which he brought out on the occasion of its golden jubilee is a monumental work which is not only the history of that institution but also a history of India during the period to which it relates. He was also intimately associated with the people's movement in Indian States. He was Vice-President and later President of the States Peoples Congress.

In his death India has lost a great patriot. As a mark of respect to his memory I request you all to stand in silence for two minutes.

*(All the Hon'ble Members stood in silence for two minutes.)*

### STATEMENT BY THE MINISTER Re. SHARAVATHI PROJECT

Mr. SPEAKER.—The Hon. Minister for Public Works Department has made a request that he may be permitted to make a statement in this House. I have allowed the Minister to make the statement under Rule 306 which reads as follows :

“ A statement may be made by a Minister on a matter of public importance with the consent of the Speaker, but no question shall be asked at the time the statement is made ”.

Sri B. K. PUTTARAMIYA (Channapatna).—Can we ask questions after the statement ?

Mr. SPEAKER.—I will see what can be done after the statement ; no question can be put in the course of the statement.

Sri G. N. PUTTANNA (Tumkur).—Will we be supplied with copies of the statement ?

Mr. SPEAKER.—Yes.

Sri C. M. ARUMUGHAM (Kolar Gold Fields).—Do we get a chance to discuss the statement ?

Mr. SPEAKER.—We will see later.

Sri B. K. PUTTARAMIYA.—What is the use of his making a statement if we cannot discuss the statement? It will be only a waste of time. The Minister could as well call a press conference.

Mr. SPEAKER.—Under the rules, the Minister is entitled to make a statement on matters concerning his department, which are of importance. After the statement, if the Members feel that it should be taken for discussion, they can make a request under the rules.

Sri C. J. MUCKANNAPPA (Gubbi).—I would like to know whether under the rules the Minister's statement can get priority over the business mentioned in the Agenda.

Mr. SPEAKER.—There is no question of any rule. It can get priority.

### Preamble.

Sri H. M. CHANNABASAPPA (Minister for Public Works and Electricity).—There has of late been some criticism about the entrustment of the Civil Works in Sharavathy Project, like construction of Dams and Tunnels, and of the supply of materials like Surki and lime, to 'A' Class contractors, instead of executing the works departmentally. It has been complained that this procedure has put out of employment thousands of piece-workers and labourers working in the Project. It is also expressed in certain quarters that the accepted tender rates for these works are on the high side. It is therefore considered necessary to clear the misapprehension in this behalf.

2. Before dealing with these points, it would be helpful if a brief account were given of the procedure adopted in regard to the framing of the estimates and of the organization set up for dealing with issues arising from the execution of the Project from time to time.

### Original Estimates.

3. The first estimates for the Sharavathy Hydro-Electric Project were prepared as long ago as in 1954, providing for a three-stage work on the installation of Ten Generators with a capacity of 71,000 KWs. each. Details under the 1st and 2nd Stages were more or less fully worked out, but those proposed under the third stage were only partially provided for. The first stage which contemplated the installation of two units was estimated to cost Rs. 2,297 lakhs. The break-up for this estimate, which was sanctioned by Government in July 1956, is given below :—

	<i>Rs. in lakhs.</i>
1. Civil Engineering works ...	1,323
2. Hydraulic and Electrical Engineering Works.	539
3. Transmission lines ...	234
4. Receiving Stations Equipment.	191
5. Miscellaneous	10
	<hr/> 2,297

The Civil Engineering Works were to consist mainly of two dams, one at Linganamakki and another at Talakalale, with a power channel and tunnel in between the two and a pressure tunnel beyond Talakalale Dam.

4. It has to be mentioned that the rates adopted in this estimate for the Civil Engineering works were the Schedule rates for the year 1954-55 for the area, suitably modified after taking into account the experience gained in the construction of the Bhadra Project, which was then the nearest big project under construction. It is also necessary to point out that the Civil Engineering Works included in this estimate provided for masonry dams only in the river-bed portions and for earthen bund on the flanks.

### Change in scope of Project and Detailed Estimates.

5. Work on the Project was started on the basis of departmental execution from November 1955 and proceeded comparatively slowly in the initial stages, pending a decision on certain important issues like the substitution of masonry for the earthen portion of the dams proposed earlier, the type of mortar to be used for masonry, replacement of the forebay by Surge tanks, increasing the capacity of the Reservoir, enhancement of the capacity of the generating units from 71,000 KWs. to 89,100 KWs. providing for a duplicate Water Conductor system instead of a single system, etc., all of which were being examined in consultation with the Central Water and Power Commission. By 1958, decisions had been taken on almost all these matters with the result that the original estimate for the first stage, particularly in regard to Civil Engineering Works, had to be drastically modified. Consequent on these decisions, the following major changes were introduced :—

- (i) The capacity of each generating unit was increased from 71,000 KW. to 89,100 KW.
- (ii) The capacity of the water conductor system viz., the

(SRI H. M. CHANNABASAPPA)

power channel, tunnels and pen-stocks was suitably increased;

- (iii) The design of the dam at Talakalale and Linganamakki was changed from composite type to masonry involving an increase in masonry from 1.92 lakh units to 6.73 lakh units;
- (iv) Duplicate pressure tunnels were proposed in place of a single tunnel; and
- (v) Two Vertical Surge tanks were proposed in place of open type forebay at the end of Vodenbyle tunnel.

6. As a result of all these changes, which were effected in consultation with the Central Water and Power Commission and under expert advice, the estimates for the first stage of the Project had to be changed to Rs. 3,965.38 lakhs, for which the break-up is given below :—

Sl. No.	Particulars	Rs. in lakhs as per	
		Original Estimate	Revised Proposal
		Rs.	Rs.
1	Civil Engineering Works.	1,323	2,784.5
2	Hydraulic and Electrical Engineering Works.	539	615.5
3	Transmission lines...	234	305.33
4	Receiving Stations...	191	260.00
5	Miscellaneous ...	10	...
		2,297	3,965.38

7. Even in this estimate, the rates for masonry remained unchanged. Thus, at the time the tenders were called for, the estimate incorporated only the old rates, *viz.*, those of 1954-55, for masonry.

### Organisation for dealing with Project matters—Hydro - Electric Construction Projects Board.

8. A Special Chief Engineer is appointed to be exclusively in charge of the execution of Civil Works of the Project, with 3 Circles and 14 Divisions from March, 1958. On the Hydro-Electric side, a Chief Engineer with necessary personnel for designs and execution has been in charge from September, 1957. A High Power Board called "The Hydro-Electric Construction Projects Board" has been constituted and is made responsible for all Hydro-Electric Project Works in the State. The following are the personnel constituting the Board :—

- (1) Minister for Public Works and Electricity (Chairman).

*Sriyuths :—*

- (2) N. N. Iyengar, R.S., E.E., Retired Chief Engineer (Member).
- (3) M. S. Thirumale Iyengar, I.S.E., Chief Engineer, Hirakud Dam Project (Member).
- (4) M. Narasimhaiya, B.A., C.E., Retired Chief Engineer (Member).
- (5) B. S. Narasinga Rao, B.A., B.E., Retired Chief Engineer (Member).
- (6) H. Ananthachar, B.E., A.M. I.E., Retired Chief Engineer (Member).
- (7) The Secretary to Government, Finance Department (Member).
- (8) The Secretary to Government, Public Works and Electricity (Member).
- (9) The Secretary to Government, Planning and Development Department (Member).
- (10) The Chief Engineer, Mysore State Electricity Board (Member).
- (11) The Chief Engineer, Hydro-Electric Construction Projects (Member).
- (12) The Special Chief Engineer, Sharavathy Valley Project (Member).

9. The functions of this Board are to consider from time to time and take decisions on the following matters :—

(a) To give financial sanction to specific detailed items of expenditure within the limits of budget provision in each year ;

(b) To make contracts and sanction tenders in respect of matters which may be beyond the limits of powers delegated to the Chief Electrical Engineer and the Special Chief Engineer ;

(c) To make variations of contracts and estimates, sanction for which may be beyond the competence of the Chief Electrical Engineer and the Special Chief Engineer ;

(d) To approve purchases and authorise the placing of all orders for the materials required for the Project through the Secretary, Stores Purchase Committee ; and

(e) To create or abolish posts, the maximum pay of which does not exceed Rs. 200 ;

(f) To review the Progress achieved in the Project from time to time.

10. Two Committees to advise the Board on technical issues arising respectively on the Civil Engineering and Electrical Engineering sides, have also been constituted, consisting of the technical members of the Board. While the routine proposals made by the Special Chief Engineer are dealt with by the Administrative Departments concerned, all major or important proposals, especially in regard to purchases, tenders, etc., are first dealt with by the Board before they are considered by Government.

#### **Items of work entrusted to Contractors.**

11. The main items of work on the civil side are :—

(i) Excavations of foundations for Linganamakki and Talakalale Dams ;

(ii) Excavations of Power Channel ;

(iii) Construction of masonry dams at Linganamakki and Talakalale ;

(iv) Construction of tunnels at Malali and Vodenbyle ; and

(v) Supply of Surki and burnt lime.

12. The first two items are being done departmentally through piece-workers and it is proposed to continue these arrangements in future also. It is only the last three items that are given to contractors after calling for tenders.

#### **Award of Works on Contract—Rule and not the Exception.**

13. The criticism in regard to the entrustment of important civil works like construction of dam, masonry and tunnels and the supply of materials like Surki and lime may now be dealt with.

14. It must be stated at the outset that the award of works on contract after calling for tenders is the rule and not the exception under the provisions of the Public Works Accounts Code. Departmental execution of works is on the other hand an exception to the rule and specific orders of Government are necessary to adopt this procedure.

#### **Circumstances in which Departmental Execution was resorted to previously.**

15 It is true that the construction of Projects of magnitude in the old Mysore State has, according to a long-standing practice, been done in the past departmentally. Works like Vani Vilas Sagar, Chamarajasagar, Krishnarajasagar, etc., were thus executed departmentally and even now, the construction of the dam at Bhadra is being executed in the same manner. This practice has been in vogue in the past for various reasons. At that time we had enough of suitable and efficient technical personnel and there was paucity of experienced and efficient contractors to handle works of magnitude. The works were of comparatively smaller magnitude and there



(SRI H. M. CHANNABASAPPA)

was also a less pressing sense of urgency. In most places outside Mysore State, however, the practice has been, and is, different. The Tungabhadra Dam, for instance, was partly constructed departmentally and partly through contractors. Dams elsewhere in India like Koyna, Rihand, Chambal, etc., are being built, not departmentally, but through contractors. Even in Mysore, it may be recalled that the work of constructing the tunnel for the Bhadra Project was entrusted last year to a firm of contractors. The entrustment of works of magnitude to contractors is thus not a novel practice in the country or even in Mysore, and is in any case strictly according to the prescribed procedure.

#### **Drawbacks in Departmental Execution.**

16. Certain very important considerations have to be borne in mind in the execution of works of magnitude departmentally :—

(i) The Department has to have a large supply of trained and experienced personnel for the execution of the works ;

(ii) Heavy equipment and machinery in adequate quantities has to be available at hand and personnel trained in the use of such machinery and equipment will also have to be readily and continuously available ;

(iii) Experience in respect of a number of Projects shows that departmental execution is generally slow and prolonged. For quick and speedy execution of work, it is inevitable that works of magnitude should be apportioned among agencies having the necessary organization, skilled personnel and suitable machinery and equipment so that the prescribed targets may be achieved in a given time ;

(iv) No reliable estimates of the ultimate costs of a project could be had on the basis of departmental working as it is not practicable to fix rates of working in advance over a period of years. On the other hand, execution

of the work by contractors at predetermined rates would give a ready and reliable estimate of final costs. Also, with the rising trend in prices of materials and wage rates, the rates for departmental working are bound to rise year after year, whereas fixed rates will have been determined beforehand in the case of entrustment of the work to the contractors.

(v) In any departmental execution the department will have to have direct control and management over a large labour force with all the attendant difficulties which are too well known to be detailed.

17. Thus, two important elements involved in departmental working are the need for adequate technical personnel, machinery and equipment and the uncertainty of rates and ultimate costs. With regard to personnel, it has been found very difficult to get personnel of adequate experience in sufficient numbers for securing the kind of intensive and extensive supervision that is required in the case of departmental working. As regards machinery and equipment, it is well-known that owing to foreign exchange difficulties, equipment and machinery of the magnitude and value required for a Project of this size cannot be had in time or in sufficient number. Even granting that the foreign exchange difficulties could be got over, time would be an essential factor in the procurement of the machinery and equipment. Before they could be got from abroad, attempts would have to be made to mop up available resources in the country and there would have to be a very careful check of the used machinery procured within the country in order to see that it is in working condition and is useful. This would necessarily be a prolonged process and there would be no guarantee that all the required machinery and equipment in good working condition would be available in time. On the other hand, it is well-known that there are a number of contractors and firms in India with experienced personnel and adequate machinery and equipment who could tackle works of magnitude

and whose resources could be put to use with consequent speed in execution.

#### **Time factor most vital.**

18. Above all, the most important consideration in the execution of a work like Sharavathi Hydro-Electric Project would be the need for its completion within the prescribed target date, so that the present acute scarcity of power which has impeded progress on industrial, agricultural and other fronts in the State to a considerable extent, should be overcome at the earliest possible date. The present state of stagnation in regard to industrial development caused by power shortage can no longer be allowed to continue without serious detriment to the economy of the State and the country as a whole. It would have been a serious omission on the part of Government if all steps necessary to complete the Project in the shortest time possible had not been taken. There cannot be the least doubt that with departmental working or by entrusting the work to piece-workers in small bits as was being done until last year, the work could not be executed within a reasonably short period of time. A comparison with old practices has no longer any validity whatsoever to-day, when the need is for quick execution and prompt realisation of benefits. To give some examples, works like Krishnarajasagar and Bhadra were or are being executed over periods ranging from 12 to 20 years. Sharavathi Project with a masonry construction programme of over 6.73 crores c.ft. which is as big as that of Krishnarajasagar, Tunga Bhadra and Bhadra dams put together is to be completed in less than three years from now. So far as tunnel works are concerned, execution by the department or through piece-workers would be absolutely out of the question in the present conditions and in view of the heavy equipment, special skill and experience required. It is precisely for these reasons that after a prolonged and disappointing experiment in departmental working in the case of Bhadra Tunnel, execution through contractors was resorted to.

#### **Optimum Size of Work for inviting Tenders.**

19. A point that may be referred to in this connection is about the magnitude of the work that may be awarded to individual contractors. Obviously the main consideration would have to be convenience of working. Other considerations such as availability of sources for materials, like quarries, separate approach roads to work-spots, facilities for the movement and use of machinery and equipment for the purpose of construction, etc., will also have to be taken into account. In the light of these considerations, it was felt desirable to divide the Linganamakki Dam into a number of Sections varying from 600' to 1,300' in length.

#### **Board's Recommendations to let out the Works on Contract.**

20. The award of the works referred to above on contract on tender basis was on a full consideration of the issue unanimously recommended by the Board and accepted by Government in the light of the conditions prevalent in the locality and in view of the pressing need for early completion of the Project and realisation of the benefits.

#### **Apprehension that Pieceworkers and Labourers are thrown out of Employment baseless.**

21. In regard to the apprehension entertained in some quarters that owing to the entrustment of important works like masonry to big contractors, thousands of piece-workers and labourers have been put out of employment, it may be stated that it is quite contrary to facts. In the first place, it must be made clear that not all the items under Civil Engineering Works have been entrusted to contractors. Items like earthwork for foundations, excavation for power channel, grinding of surki mortar and a number of miscellaneous works connected with the project are still being done through piece-workers or departmental agency. This arrangement is proposed to be

(SRI H. M. CHANNABASAPPA)

continued event in future. There is, therefore, ample scope for the utilisation of all the piece-workers and workers that may be available for this purpose. Actually, almost all the piece-workers are fully engaged to-day and so far as Government are aware no piece-workers have been turned away for want of work in the project area. As regards labour, it is needless to say that even with the entrustment of the work to the contractors, there is still abundant work for a large number of piece-work contractors and labour force. As a matter of fact, the labour force that is now available at site is insufficient for executing the work at the required speed and there is therefore need for an even larger labour force than that employed at present. The fear that either the piece-workers or the labour would be out of employment on account of the procedure adopted is therefore totally unfounded.

#### **Criticism regarding accepted Tender Rates.**

22. The next important criticism levelled in regard to the execution of the work on the project is about the acceptance by Government of what are stated to be unduly high rates for the works let out on contract. The reasonableness or otherwise of tendered rates would necessarily have to be judged with reference to workable rates. Mention has already been made earlier as to how the original and the revised estimates for the Civil Engineering Works were framed in this case. It will be seen therefrom that at the time the tenders were called for, the rates provided in the revised estimate for masonry works were those appropriate to the year 1954-55. It need hardly be said that over a period of five to six years from 1954-55 to 1959-60, there has been a considerable increase in the prices of materials, machinery and in wage rates. For instance the rate for earth work in all soils including lead and lift, etc., which was Rs. 40 per 1,000 c.ft in the original estimate is now working out

to Rs. 120 on an average on piece-work system. This is indicative of the rising trend of rates during these five to six years.

#### **Accepted Rates for Tunnels—lower than Estimated Rates.**

23. It must, however, be mentioned at this stage that among the main items, which constitute the bulk of the work and which have been put to tender, namely, rubble masonry and tunnels, it is only in the case of masonry that the rates tendered and accepted are higher than those provided in the estimates. In regard to tunnels, the rates accepted have been lower than those provided in the estimate. It may be asked why the tendered rates are lower than the estimated rates in the case of tunnels, whereas, they are higher in some cases in dams. The reason is that in recasting the estimate during 1958 before calling for tenders, workable rates were provided for these items in the light of the experience gained in Bhadra Project and large amounts were provided in the estimate in the form of lumpsum to meet miscellaneous items of expenditure. It is also important to note that unlike the work on dams which can only be executed during the nonmonsoon period, the work of excavation of tunnels could be done throughout the year, after making suitable arrangements for the diversion of water.

#### **Three ways of judging reasonableness of Tender Rates.**

24 Thus the question confines itself to the accepted tender rates for works relating to dam masonry. Broadly speaking, there would be three ways of assessing the reasonableness of these rates, and they are as follows :—

(i) To examine the rates in the light of departmental rates at the place and at the time of calling for tenders after making necessary additions for the extra items involved ;

(ii) To judge the rates with reference to those prevailing for similar work in a nearby project or

in projects elsewhere, after making necessary adjustments in order to provide for the differences in working conditions and wage structures, etc.; and

(iii) To compare the rates with data rates for each kind of work for which tender has been called for, after providing for all necessary components.

25. It is proposed to examine the accepted tender rates in all the three ways.

#### **Comparison with Departmental Rates at Sharavathy.**

26. To take up first, the comparison with actual departmental rates, it may be mentioned that since the commencement of the execution of works, only rubble masonry in cement mortar has actually been constructed and that in surki mortar had not yet commenced at the time of entrustment of work to contractors, although action had been taken to collect rubble, surki and lime. In order to enable a realistic comparison of the departmental rates at Sharavathy for rubble masonry in cement mortar (1 : 4) at the time of calling for tenders with that of the accepted rates, the cost of certain extra items involved therein will have to be added to them. In arriving at the comparable rates, due regard is to be paid to the following relevant facts:—

(i) The work of rubble masonry in cement mortar carried out by the Department has been wholly executed with sand obtained near the Kargal anicut with a lead of 2 to 3 miles, while the contractors, according to their tender agreements, will have to obtain sand from near Shimoga with a lead of about 80 miles owing to the very limited supply of sand in the Sharavathy area. This increased lead by itself increases the cost of masonry in cement mortar by Rs. 27 per unit;

(ii) In arriving at the departmental rate, the cost of second conveyance of rubble from stacking yards and of the collection of the sand from Kargal anicut and of cement from Departmental stores which have been effected with departmental lorries

has been taken into account, and this works out comparatively cheaper than that in the case of private lorries obtained on hire;

(iii) The work so far carried out by the Department was relatively easy, being confined more or less to ground level, while the contractors' rates hold good for heights up to 150 ft. above river-bed level (1st stage work). Normally lift charges varying from Rs. 2 to Rs. 3 for every 10 ft. of lift will have to be provided. The increase in the cost of masonry on this account is of the order of Rs. 12 to Rs. 18 per unit of 100 c. ft.;

(iv) Certain recurring and inevitable items like flood diversion, baling out water, silt-removal, etc. have been carried out by the Department at substantial expenditure prior to and during the progress of masonry. The expenditure on these items is not being exhibited under the item of masonry and is not taken into account in determining the rate for masonry or concrete in departmental working. After the foundations have been handed over to the contractor, these items become their responsibility and will involve additional liability which they will have to incur;

(v) Roads to quarries and approaches to workspots have been done by the Department at considerable expenditure which, however, appears under the head "Other Works—Miscellaneous" and does not go to determine the cost of masonry in departmental working. According to the agreement with the contractors, they are required to make all new roads and provide as many approaches as may be necessary. As the expenditure on these items, especially in an area of heavy rainfall, is considerable, the contractor's rate will necessarily include it for the full period of contract;

(vi) The departmental rate represents the average expenditure per unit of work at a given time, generally based on a period of one year, whereas the contractor is required to execute the work under varying conditions which might prevail during the period of the contract. Rise in prices of

(SRI H. M. CHANNABASAPPA)

machinery, and materials, in wages for labour and in transportation costs, etc., will have to be borne by the contractor and will have been incorporated in his rates;

(vii) Besides expenditure on other items which do not actually come into the working of the masonry cost when executed departmentally, there are certain items like housing for labour, health and sanitary measures, cost of petty supervision, etc., on all of which considerable expenditure is incurred by the department under the appropriate heads in the estimate but which do not go into the working of the masonry costs per unit. The contractor will have to provide for these items of expenditure in his rates.

#### Criteria for comparison with Bhadra Project Rates.

27. A second mode of comparison would be with rates for similar work

that obtain in other projects after making suitable adjustments for the difference in conditions of working and other factors if any. It is found that for rubble masonry in surki mortar which constitutes the bulk of the dam masonry in the case of Bhadra Project, the cost as per departmental work is Rs. 117 per unit of 100 c.ft. Since this work is virtually at levels which could be approached direct by the transport vehicles, it may be assumed that the rate is appropriate to the ground level.

28. In comparing the rate of Rs. 117 per unit of masonry in surki mortar for the Bhadra Project with the accepted rates for the Sharavathy Project, it has to be borne in mind that the conditions of working, the wage rates and the lead for materials, etc., in Sharavathy are materially different from those at Bhadra. Some of the varying conditions are indicated below :

<i>Points</i>	<i>Bhadra Project</i>	<i>Sharavathi Project</i>
Average rainfall	... 40"	... 220"
Topography	... Mildly rolling	... Hilly
No. of working days	... 266 days	... 200 days
Lead for rubble	... 16 miles	... 7 to 15 miles
Lead for Kankar	... 55 miles	... 100 miles
Lead for Surki	... 1—1½ miles	... 2—3 mil <sup>2</sup>
Lead for sand	... 7 miles	... 80 miles
Unskilled labour rates	... Rs. 1.0 to 1.75	... Rs. 1.0 to 2.5
Heavy and Skilled labour rates.	Rs. 1.75 to 2.5	... Rs. 3.0 to 4.5

29. After making due allowance for these variations and providing for other factors mentioned at para 26, it is found that the accepted tender rates for Rubble Masonry will actually be less than the workable rates so derived.

#### Tender Rates as against Current Schedule Rates.

30. A comparison may also be made with the data rates for finished items of works, that is to say, workable rates at the spot at the present time, taking into consideration all the relevant factors, viz., lead and lift, availability of material and conditions

of working, etc. On the basis of such data, rates for the important items of work have been incorporated in the schedule of rates for 1959-60. These rates represent the average for the whole project area and for year for which they are prepared, and are based on certain assumptions regarding lead and lift. For the purpose of proper comparison of the accepted rates with the schedule of rates, necessary adjustments have to be made for additional items contemplated in the tender notification and not provided in the schedule rates and for such of the extra items set out in para 26 as may be involved in the work tendered for.

**Rates for Supply of Surki and Burnt Lime.**

31. A word may be said about rates for surki and burnt lime whose supply has also been let out on contract on the basis of tenders. While comparisons may be made in the same manner as in the case of dam masonry, it would be sufficient to point out that the schedule rate for collection of surki for the year 1959-60 is Rs. 56 per unit as against the average tender rate accepted, *viz.*, Rs. 56.25 per unit. In the case of burnt lime, the schedule rate and the average accepted tender rate are respectively Rs. 260 and Rs. 247.50 per unit. It may be mentioned here that supplies of kankar and surki have also been done both at Bhadra

and Sharavathi before calling for tenders and fixing up contractors. The accepted tender rates may also be compared with them. In order to enable a proper comparison, necessary adjustments will have to be made for differences in items like lead, etc.

**Comparative Statement of Rates.**

32. For the purpose of assessing the reasonableness or otherwise of the accepted tender rates for the several items of work given to contractors a comparative statement based on the three ways set out in para 24, along with the corresponding rates of 1954-55 provided in the Estimate, is given below in Statement No. I:—

SRI H. M. CHANNABASAPPA)

## STATEMENT No. I.

Comparative Statement of Rates based on the three Criteria set out in para (24).

(1) Items of Work	(2) Rates provided in the Estimate of 1954-55.	(3) Average Departmental rates at Sharavathi at the time of calling for tenders with necessary additions for appropriate items set out at 'A' below.	(4) Average Departmental rates at Bhadra at the time of calling for tenders with necessary additions for appropriate items set out at 'A' below.	(5) Average Schedule of rates for 1959-60 (in Rs. per unit of 100 C.ft.)	(6) Accepted tender rates in Rs. per unit of 100 C. ft.
1.4. Cement mortar to 20 per cent of the total Masonry).	...	222.21	221.9	(a) 208.5	(b) 180.00 to 220.00
1.4. Cement mortar in Surki Mortar to 85 per cent of the total Masonry).	125.00	170.03	171.85	(a) 157.50	(b) 145.20 to 170.61
1.4. Surki ...	...	55.86	56.58	5.00	(b) 55.00 to 57.55
1.4. Burnt lime	...	260.35	251.43	260.00	(b) 245.00 to 250.00

(a) The schedule rates do not provide for some of the overheads like labour amenities, health and sanitation, baling of water, silt clearance, etc., set out at 'A' below whereas they are included for in the rates given in columns (3) and (4) and presumed to have included in the rates given in column (6).

(b) (i) These rates hold good for the entire period of contract, viz., 1959-60 to 1962-63 and are inclusive of the cost of items mentioned at 'A' below.

(ii) Surki, mortar, cement and steel will be supplied by the Department at rates specified in the tender notifications.

'A' (i) Contractors' profit  
(ii) Lead and Lift Charges,  
(iii) Labour amenities,  
(iv) Health and Sanitation,

(v) Flood diversion,  
(vi) Silt-clearance,  
(vii) Roads and approaches to quarries, etc.



**Excess in cost over current Schedule rates only 2.9 per cent.**

33. A comparative statement of cost of works entrusted to contractors as worked out on the basis of current schedule of rates (1959-60) for various items of work tendered and

the accepted tender rates is also given below in statement No. II. The figures given in respect of Talakalale and Linganamakki dams in Columns 2 and 3 of the Statement are exclusive of the cost of surki mortar which is supplied by the Department at rates stipulated in the tender notification.

**STATEMENT No. II**

Comparative Statement of costs based on the current schedule of rates for 1959-60 and the accepted tender rates.

Details (1)	Estimated amount according to current Schedule rate, (2)	Estimated amount according to Accepted tender rates (3)	Percentage excess (+) savings (—) (4)
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1. Linganamakki Dam ...	761,58,806	819,80,459	58,21,653 (+7.64%)
2. Talakalale Dam ...	157,29,164	141,09,556	16,19,600 (—10.29%)
3. Malali Tunnel ...	61,57,213	58,55,033	3,02,180 (—4.9%)
4. Supply of Surki ...	94,79,680	96,78,600	1,98,920 (+2.1%)
5. Supply of burnt limes ...	123,81,200	117,53,800	6,27,400 (—5.07%)
	11,99,06,063	12,33,77,448	34,71,385 (+2.9%)

**Rates within Reasonable Limits.**

34. It is clear from the comparative rates given in statement No. I that the accepted rates are not far from either the current schedule of rates or the rates based on departmental working at Sharavathi and Bhadra with provisions for the extra items involved. Statement No. II makes things more clear and gives a fair idea of the actual excess involved on account of the entrustment of these

works to contractors. The excess in cost as calculated on the basis of current schedule rates, is of the order of 2.9 per cent and can by no means be considered to be on the high side. It is specially so in view of the rates being through rates over a period of more than three years, and of the rising trend in the prices of materials and machinery and in wage levels. It may be mentioned here that the entrustment of some of these works to contractors would not only ensure

(SRI H. M. CHANNABASAPPA)

speedy execution of the project and realisation of benefits but also result in considerable savings of money under establishment and temporary quarters for the staff. The department has already retrenched two Divisions along with most of the attached staff.

### **May Result in Savings.**

35. If the expenditure on the miscellaneous items referred to above, the savings under establishment and temporary quarters for staff and the likely increase in price and wage levels during the period of contract are taken into consideration the apparent excess of 2.9 per cent is likely to disappear, and it is possible that it may result in considerable savings.

36. It is thus seen that in whatever reasonable manner a comparison of the accepted tender rates is effected, the conclusion is inevitable that the accepted tender rates are in the neighbourhood of workable rates.

### **Misapprehension based on incorrect Comparison.**

37. It is understood that some who are under the misapprehension that the rates are high have chosen to compare the accepted tender rates with those of 1954-55 provided in the estimate. It does not need any argument to say that it is incorrect.

### **Procedure for consideration of tenders.**

38. The position in regard to the acceptance of tenders for Sharavathi cannot be deemed to have been completely stated without a reference to the procedure that has been adopted, and is being adopted, in the consideration of tenders. In the case of every one of the tenders that have been received ever since tenders for various items of works were first called, the following main criteria among others have been applied before the tenders were actually taken into consideration:—

(i) Whether the tender documents were received in time and properly filled in as required ;

(ii) Whether the tenderers are registered contractors or have applied for registration according to rules ;

(iii) Whether they have deposited the necessary earnest money or furnished a standing deposit as required under rules ;

(iv) Whether they possess the requisite experience for executing the work tendered for and whether they have the necessary equipment, tools and plant and technical personnel and financial resources ; and

(v) Whether the rates quoted are reasonable and compare with the workable rates evolved by the Department.

### **Competition keen—only lowest offer accepted in all cases.**

39. The tenders in all cases were put through a close examination to see if they fulfilled these and other criteria and were then considered in detail by the Civil Engineering Committee of the Hydro-Electric Construction Projects Board and then by the Projects Board itself. At the successive board meetings which considered the tenders from time to time, the closest and most rigorous scrutiny was exercised and certain tenders were even rejected as they did not fulfil some of the conditions laid down. Thus, fresh tenders had to be called for Sections II, IV, V and VI for Linganamakki dam in view of certain defects in the original tenders. As regards the previous experience of and availability of equipment with the tenderers, special measures were taken to make a high level check of the lists of previous works executed by the contractors and of the equipment available with them. Where there were possibilities of reducing the rates owing to offers made by some of the tenderers, negotiations were resorted to with the result that there were substantial reductions in costs in a few cases. It is after due scrutiny in this manner that the Projects Board advised the acceptance of the tenders. Mention may be made here that in almost every case there was very keen competition. It is also pertinent to point out that in not

a single instance has the Board recommended or Government accepted any but the lowest offer.

### Decisions in best interests of the State.

40. It follows from all that has been set out in the foregoing paragraphs that the award of the major Civil works in Sharavathi Project on contract basis is fully justified and that the acceptance of the tender rates has been made after ensuring that the rates are reasonable and that the procedure adopted in the acceptance of the tenders is fully in accordance with the prescribed rules.

41. The completion of the Sharavathi Project in the shortest possible time is of the utmost importance to the State. Government were in duty bound to make all necessary arrangements towards that end. It would have been indeed a grave omission on the part of Government if necessary steps had not been taken in this direction. Government have therefore given the most anxious consideration to the procedures to be adopted, the mode of execution, the efficiency of the agency, the speed, quality and ultimate economy of the Project. The decisions taken by Government are thus in the best interests of the Project and the State.

**Sri H. M. CHANNABASAPPA.**—Copies will be made available to all the Hon'ble Members of this House.

**Sri M. C. NARASIMHAN** (Kolar Gold Fields).—It is rather a lengthy report. May I know if there is an opportunity for us to offer our views on this Statement?

**Mr. SPEAKER.**—We will have to think about that.

**Sri M. C. NARASIMHAN.**—We are very much thankful to the Hon'ble Minister for having given so much information without any instigation from our side. You are allowing criticisms in the papers but not on the floor of the House.

† ಶ್ರೀ ಬಿ. ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟರಾಮಯ್ಯ (ಚನ್ನಪಟ್ಟಣ).—ಸ್ಯಾಮಿ, ಈಗ ನಮ್ಮ ಮಾನ್ಯ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು ಬಹಳ ಶ್ರಮವನ್ನು ತೆಗೆದುಕೊಂಡು ಹೊರಗಡೆ ಇರತಕ್ಕ ಜನಗಳು ಯಾವ ಮಾತು ಕತೆಗಳನ್ನಾಡುವುದಕ್ಕೂ ಅವಕಾಶವಿಲ್ಲದಿರುವ ಹಾಗೆ ಇದಕ್ಕೆಲ್ಲಾ ಪ್ರಿಂಟ್ ಮಾಡಿಸಿ ನಮಗೆ ಕೊಡುತ್ತಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು ಸರ್ಕಾರ ಈಗ ಉತ್ತಮವಾದಂಥ ಕೆಲಸಗಳನ್ನು ಮಾಡುವುದಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರಾರಂಭಿಸಿದೆ ಎಂದು ಹೇಳಿದರು. ಹಿಂದೆ ವಿಧಾನ ಸಭೆಯ ಕಟ್ಟಡ ಒಂದು ಕೊಠಡಿ ರೂಪಾಯಿಗಳು ಬರ್ಚುಮಾಡಿದಾಗ, ಅದರ ಮೇಲೆ ಮೂರು ಮಂತ್ರಿ ಮಂಡಲಗಳ ಅವಧಿಯಲ್ಲೂ ಚರ್ಚೆಯಾಯಿತು. ಈಗ ಸುಮಾರು 30 ಕೊಠಡಿ ರೂಪಾಯಿಗಳನ್ನು ಬರ್ಚುಮಾಡುವ ಈ ಒಂದು ವ್ಯವಹಾರವಿದೆ. ಅದರ ಬಗ್ಗೆ ನನಗೆ ಅನುಮಾನವಿಡೆಯೆಂದೇನೂ ಅಲ್ಲ. ಆದರೂ ಈ ಸಭೆಯಲ್ಲಿ ಈ ವಿಷಯದ ಮೇಲೆ ಮೂರು ದಿವಸಗಳಾದರೂ ಚರ್ಚೆಯಾದುವುದಕ್ಕೆ ಅವಕಾಶವನ್ನು ಕಲ್ಪಿಸಿಕೊಡಬೇಕು. ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು ಸುಮಾರು 29-30 ಪುಟಗಳಷ್ಟು ಇರತಕ್ಕ ರಿಪೋರ್ಟನ್ನು ಓದಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಅಷ್ಟನ್ನೆಲ್ಲಾ ಚೆನ್ನಾಗಿ ಓದಿಕೊಂಡು ಅದರಲ್ಲಿ ಲೋಪ ದೋಷಗಳೇನೋ ಇಲ್ಲವೇ ಎಂಬುದನ್ನು ಕಂಡುಹಿಡಿದು ನಮ್ಮ ಅಭಿಪ್ರಾಯವನ್ನು ಕೊಡುವುದು ನಮ್ಮ ಜವಾಬ್ದಾರಿಯಾಗಿದೆ. ಆ ಜವಾಬ್ದಾರಿ ಈ ಸಭೆಗೂ ಸೇರಿದೆ. ದೇಶದ ಹಣದಲ್ಲಿ 30 ಕೊಠಡಿ ರೂಪಾಯಿಗಳನ್ನು ಬರ್ಚುಮಾಡುವಾಗ, ಒಬ್ಬ ಮಂತ್ರಿಯು ಕ್ಲೆಗೆ 30 ಕೊಠಡಿ ರೂಪಾಯಿಗಳ ವ್ಯವಹಾರವನ್ನು ಈ ಸಭೆ ಒಪ್ಪಿಕೊಡುವಾಗ ಈ ವಿಷಯದ ಮೇಲೆ ಎಲ್ಲ ಸದಸ್ಯರೂ ತಮ್ಮ ಅಭಿಪ್ರಾಯವನ್ನು ಕೊಡಬೇಕಾದ ಅವಶ್ಯಕತೆ ಖಂಡಿತವಾಗಿ ಇದೆ. ಈ ಬಗ್ಗೆ ವಿಪುಲವಾದ ಚರ್ಚೆಯಾಗಬೇಕಾಗಿದೆ. ಕೇವಲ ಒಂದು ಕೊಠಡಿ ರೂಪಾಯಿಗಳ ಬರ್ಚಿನಲ್ಲಿ ವಿಧಾನಸಭೆ ಕಟ್ಟಡವಾದಾಗ ನನ್ನ ಮಾನ್ಯವಿತ್ತರಾದ ಶ್ರೀಮಾನ್ ಪುಟ್ಟ ಸ್ಯಾಮಿಯವರೊಬ್ಬರೇ ಮೂರು ಮಂತ್ರಿಮಂಡಲಗಳ ಅವಧಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ಎಷ್ಟೆಷ್ಟು ದಿವಸಗಳು ಚರ್ಚೆ ಮಾಡಿದ್ದಾರೆಂಬುದನ್ನು ನಾನು ಬಲ್ಲೆ. ಈಗ ಏಕೆ ಅವರಿಗೆ ಇಷ್ಟು ಆತುರವೋ ನನಗೆ ಗೊತ್ತಿಲ್ಲ. ಏತೆ ಕ್ಯೋನ್ಸರ ಇಷ್ಟು ಲಘುವಾಗಿ ಈ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ತೆಗೆದುಕೊಂಡು ಮಾತಾಡುತ್ತಾರೋ ತಿಳಿಯದು. ಸರ್ಕಾರ 30 ಕೊಠಡಿ ರೂಪಾಯಿಗಳನ್ನು ಮಾತ್ರ ಕಬಾಬಿಗೆ ಬರ್ಚುಮಾಡುತ್ತಾರೆ, ಎರೋಧ ಪಕ್ಷದವರು ಸಮ್ಮತಿ ಕೊಟ್ಟುಬಿಡಲಿ ಏಕೆ ಸುಮ್ಮನೆ ಚರ್ಚೆ ಎಂದು ಅವರು ಸರ್ಕಾರದ ಕಡೆಯೇ ಏಕೆ ಮಾತನಾಡುತ್ತಾರೋ ಇದರ ಒಳಗುಟ್ಟು ನನಗೆ ಗೊತ್ತಿಲ್ಲ. ಅವರನ್ನು ಬೆಂಕಿಗೆ ಹಾಕಿದರೂ ಬೆಂಕಿಯಿಂದ ಹೊರಗೆ ಬರಬೇಕು.

ಶ್ರೀ ಎಚ್. ಎಂ. ಚನ್ನಬಸಪ್ಪ.—ಬೆಂಕಿಯಿಂದ ಹೊರಗೆ ಬಂದು ಎಷ್ಟೋ ದಿವಸಗಳಾಗಿ ಹೋಯಿತು.

**Sri M. C. NARASIMHAN.**—The leader of the House can explain.

**Mr. SPEAKER.**—Do you want that he should say 'yes' or 'no'?

ಶ್ರೀ ಎಂ. ರಾಮಪ್ಪ.—'Yes' or 'no' ಎಂದು ಹೇಳುವುದು ಬೇಡ, ಕನ್ಸಿಡರ್ ಮಾಡುತ್ತೇವೆಂದು ಹೇಳಲಿ, ಸಾಕು. ಇಲ್ಲದಿದ್ದರೆ ಈ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಮುಧ್ಯಾಪ್ತ ಪರಾಲ್ಪೋಚಿಸಿ ಫಲಿತಾಂಶವನ್ನು ಸಾಯಂಕಾಲದೊಳಗೆ ಹೇಳಲಿ.

ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷರು.—ಸಭಾನಾಯಕರು ಮತ್ತು ವಿರೋಧ ಪಕ್ಷದ ನಾಯಕರು ಇಬ್ಬರೂ ಈ ಸಭೆಯಲ್ಲಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಎಲ್ಲವನ್ನೂ ವಿಚಾರಮಾಡಿ ನೋಡೋಣ. ಯಾವ ದಾದರೂ ಒಂದು ರೀತಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ಕಾಲವನ್ನು ನಿಗದಿ ಈ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಚರ್ಚಿಸೋಣ.

ಶ್ರೀ ಬಿ. ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟರಾಮಯ್ಯ.—ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಮಾಡಿ ಅಪ್ಪು ಧೈರ್ಯವಿದ್ದರೆ, ಈ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಚರ್ಚೆ ಮಾಡುವುದಿಲ್ಲ ಎಂದು ಈಗಲೇ ಹೇಳಲಿ.

Mr. SPEAKER.—You are practical.

Sri M. C. NARASIMHAN.—will he reply by to-morrow?

ಶ್ರೀ ಬಿ. ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟರಾಮಯ್ಯ.—ಈ ವಿಷಯದ ಮೇಲೆ ಚರ್ಚೆಗೆ ಅವಕಾಶವಿಲ್ಲವೆಂದು ಹೇಳಲಿ, ಸಾಕು. ದೇಶದ ಹಣದಲ್ಲಿ 30 ಕೋಟಿ ರೂಪಾಯಿಗಳನ್ನು ಬಳಸುವುದಕ್ಕಾಗಿ, ಚರ್ಚೆಗೆ ಅವಕಾಶವಿಲ್ಲವೆಂದು, ಅವರಿಗೆ ಹೇಗೆ ಹೇಳುವುದಕ್ಕಾಗುತ್ತದೆಯೋ ನೋಡೋಣ.

Sri B. D. JATTI (Chief Minister).—The Statement has been made available to the Members. Let them read it. If they feel that there is something for which a discussion is necessary, we will see. It is not possible for me at this stage to say 'yes' or 'no'.

ಶ್ರೀ ಬಿ. ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟರಾಮಯ್ಯ.—ಇದೇನು 'ಹೆಸ್ಟಿಟೇಷನ್' ಅಲ್ಲ, ಸ್ವಾಮಿ.

ಶ್ರೀ ಎಚ್. ಎಂ. ಚನ್ನಬಸಪ್ಪ.—ಚರ್ಚೆಯಾಗುವುದಾದರೆ ಇದನ್ನು ಓದಬೇಕು, ಇಲ್ಲದಿದ್ದರೆ ಓದಬಾರದು ಎಂದಲ್ಲ. ಸರ್ಕಾರದ ಉದ್ದೇಶ ಇದಕ್ಕೆ ಸಂಬಂಧಪಟ್ಟಂತೆ ಸಕಲ ಮಾಹಿತಿಗಳನ್ನು ಮಾನ್ಯ ಸದಸ್ಯರಿಗೆ ಒದಗಿಸಬೇಕೆಂದಿತ್ತು. ಆ ಪ್ರಕಾರ ಈ ಸ್ಟೇಟ್‌ಮೆಂಟ್‌ನ್ನು ತಮ್ಮ ಮುಂದೆ ಇಟ್ಟಿದ್ದೇವೆ. ಅದರಿಂದ ತಮಗೆ ಎಲ್ಲ ವಿಷಯಗಳೂ ಗೊತ್ತಾಗುತ್ತವೆ. ಈ ಮಾನ್ಯ ಸಭಾಸದಸ್ಯರಿಗೆ ತಿಳಿದಿರುವ ಹಾಗೆ ಯಾವ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಮುಚ್ಚಿಡಲು ಆಗುವುದಿಲ್ಲ. ಆ ರೀತಿ ಮಾಡುವುದು ಸರ್ಕಾರದ ಉದ್ದೇಶವಲ್ಲ. ಆದ ಕಾರಣ ಮುಖ್ಯ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು ಹೇಳಿದಂತೆ ತಮಗೆ ಒದಗಿಸಿರತಕ್ಕ ಮಾಹಿತಿಗಳನ್ನೆಲ್ಲಾ ತಾವು ಚೆನ್ನಾಗಿ ಓದಿ ಇನ್ನೂ ಉಳಿದಿರುವ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ತಿಳಿಸಿ ಬೇಕಾದರೆ ಇನ್ನೊಂದು ಸ್ಟೇಟ್‌ಮೆಂಟ್‌ನ್ನು ಕೊಡುತ್ತೇವೆ. ಅದನ್ನು ಓದಿ ಆಗ ಈ ಸಭೆಯಲ್ಲಿ ಬಹುಮತ ವಿದ್ದರೆ ಈ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಚರ್ಚೆಮಾಡಲು ಮುಂದೆ ಯೋಚಿಸಬೇಕು.

ಶ್ರೀ ಬಿ. ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟರಾಮಯ್ಯ.—ಈ ಸಭೆಯ ಬಹು ಮತ ಈ ವಿಷಯದ ಚರ್ಚೆಗೆ ಇದೆಯೇ ಇಲ್ಲವೇ ಎಂದು ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು ಹೇಳುವುದು ಸರಿಯಲ್ಲ. If we feel it necessary, will you allow discussion?

ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷರು.—ಈಗ ಆ ವಿಷಯ ಬೇಡ. ನಾವೆ ಈ ವಿಚಾರವನ್ನು ತೆಗೆದುಕೊಳ್ಳೋಣ. ಈ ಸಂದೇಹಕ್ಕೆ ಏನು ಮಾಡಬೇಕೆಂಬುದನ್ನು ಮುಂದೆ ತೀರ್ಮಾನಿಸೋಣ.

ಶ್ರೀ ಬಿ. ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟರಾಮಯ್ಯ.—ಈ ಸಭೆಯ ಬಹು ಮತ ಎಂಬುದಾಗಿ ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು ಹೇಳಿದರು. ನಾನು ಅರಿಕೆಮಾಡುವುದು ಏನೆಂದರೆ, ಈ ಸಭೆಯಲ್ಲಿ ಬಹುಮತ ಇಲ್ಲದಿದ್ದರೆ ಮೆಜಾರಿಟಿ ಪಾರ್ಟಿಗೆ ಇರುವುದು. ಅದಾದರಿಂದ ಈ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಮಂತ್ರಿ

ಗಳು ಮತ್ತು ಮೆಜಾರಿಟಿ ಪಾರ್ಟಿಯು ಬೇರೆ ಕಡೆ ಚರ್ಚೆಮಾಡುವ ಅವಕಾಶವಿದೆ. ಪಾರ್ಟಿಯೊಬ್ಬಿಗೂ ನಲ್ಲ ಇದನ್ನು ಆಗಲೇ ಚರ್ಚೆಮಾಡಿ ಈ ಸಭೆಗೆ ಬಂದರೂ ಇನ್ನೂ ಈಗಲೂ ಬಹುಮತ ವಿಲ್ಲವೆಂದು ಹೇಳಿದರೆ ಹೇಗೆ?

ಶ್ರೀ ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟಸ್ವಾಮಿ (ಮೈಸೂರು).—ವಿರೋಧ ಪಕ್ಷದವರೂ ಬಹುಮತವಿರಬೇಕೆಂದು ಮಂತ್ರಿಗಳು ಹೇಳಿದ್ದು.

ಶ್ರೀ ಬಿ. ಕೆ. ಪುಟ್ಟರಾಮಯ್ಯ.—ಅದು ನನಗೆ ಗೊತ್ತಿದೆ. ಈ ವಿಷಯವನ್ನು ಮುಖ್ಯವಾಗಿ ಚರ್ಚೆ ಮಾಡಬೇಕೋ, ಬೇಡವೋ ಎಂಬುದನ್ನು ಯಾವಾಗ ಹೇಳುತ್ತೀರಿ?

ಶ್ರೀ ಬಿ. ಡಿ. ಜತ್ತಿ.—ಯಾವಾಗಲಾದರೂ ಹೇಳಬಹುದು. ಹಾಗಿದ್ದರೆ, ಇದುವರೆಗೆ ಯಾವಾಗಲೋ ಹೇಳಬಹುದಾಗಿತ್ತು. You cannot force me to reply positively at this stage.

Sri B. K. FUTTARAMIYA.—We have other remedies.

Sri B. D. JATTI.—You can use them

### MADRAS SUGAR FACTORIES CONTROL (MYSORE AMENDMENT AND VALIDATION OF LEVY OF CESS) BILL, 1959.

*Motion to consider.*

Sri T. MARIAPPA (Minister for Finance).—I beg to move:

"That the Madras Sugar Factories Control (Mysore Amendment and Validation of Levy of Cess) Bill, 1959, be taken into consideration."

Mr. SPEAKER.—Motion moved:

"That the Madras Sugar Factories Control (Mysore Amendment, and Validation of Levy of Cess) Bill, 1959, be taken into consideration."

Sri T. MARIAPPA.—Sir, this does not require any elaboration. What has been said in the Statement of Objects and Reasons would suffice. This validating legislation is necessary for us to recover the amounts due from the people.

*The House adjourned for recess at Three of the Clock and re-assembled at Thirty Minutes past Three of the Clock.*